



Evaluating Training and Certification Programs for Prospective Workers: Evidence from Participant Perceptions in Surabaya, Indonesia

Delisa Ria Winanda¹, Widyawati², Kresna Adhi Prahmana Putra³, Amirul Mustofa^{4*}

Dr. Soetomo University

Corresponding Author: Amirul Mustofa amirul.mustofa@unitomo.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Public Policy Evaluation, Job Training, Workforce Certification, William N. Dunn, Disperinaker Surabaya

Received : 5 August

Revised : 20 September

Accepted : 24 October

©2025 Winanda, Widyawati, Putra, Mustofa: This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the

[Creative Commons Atribusi 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

[Internasional.](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)



ABSTRACT

This study aims to evaluate the training and certification program for prospective workers conducted by the Surabaya City Department of Industry and Manpower (Disperinaker) using the six dimensions of public policy evaluation by William N. Dunn, namely effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and appropriateness. The research method used is a descriptive quantitative approach with a questionnaire instrument distributed to training participants. The results indicate that, in general, the training and certification program has been running quite well and provides tangible benefits to participants, especially in improving skills and recognition of certificates by businesses and industry. However, there are still challenges related to limited facilities and instructors, alignment of training outcomes with labor market needs, information dissemination, and the synchronization of competency standards. The study concludes that the training and certification program needs improvement through curriculum refinement, enhancement of infrastructure, and continuous evaluation to become more relevant, inclusive, and beneficial in reducing unemployment in Surabaya City

INTRODUCTION

Labor issues in Indonesia are characterized by an imbalance between labor force growth and limited quality job opportunities. The imbalance between labor force growth and job creation is a recurring structural challenge in Indonesia's labor dynamics and is the main source of rising open unemployment rates (Asmara & Saleh, 2024). Unemployment is a fundamental issue that requires public policies to not only be responsive but also capable of addressing labor market dynamics in a sustainable manner (Ritonga, 2021). According to (Maharani et al., 2024), Indonesia's labor market structure is still dominated by the informal sector with low productivity levels. This situation is further complicated by the demand for rapid skill enhancement amid globalization and technological advancements. These conditions make labor issues a strategic concern, particularly in the formulation of public policies at the regional level.

Local governments have a responsibility to prepare prospective workers who meet the needs of industry and the business world. This is in line with the mandate of Law Number 13 of 2003 concerning Employment, which emphasizes the role of local governments in providing a competent workforce to face the complexities of the job market. In this context, the Surabaya City Industry and Manpower Office (Disperinaker) implements training and certification programs as a strategic effort to improve the skills and competitiveness of the local workforce in the face of global competition (Amarullah et al., 2023). The implementation of this training program is also supported by national regulations, one of which is Minister of Manpower Regulation Number 5 of 2022 concerning the Accreditation of Job Training Institutions, which emphasizes the importance of competency-based training and certification. Government policies in labor have become a primary focus in creating an inclusive, sustainable, and future-oriented work environment (Afifah & Abdullah, 2024).

Competency-based training organized by BLK (Job Training Center) and accredited training institutions has proven effective in bridging the gap between industry needs and job seekers' skills (Nuraeni et al., 2022). This program covers training in various sectors, such as electrical engineering, industrial machine operators, digital marketing, and culinary arts, followed by nationally certified competency tests. This certification serves as formal proof of an individual's abilities in a particular field and increases job seekers' value in the labor market (Romadhon & Zikra, 2022). Competency-based training can significantly improve participants' work readiness, especially if the curriculum used is in line with the real needs of industry and the business world (Dharmawan et al., 2022). This is reinforced by data from the Central Statistics Agency in 2024, which shows a decline in the open unemployment rate (TPT) from 5.32% in August 2023 to 4.91% in August 2024, which also indicates the positive impact of workforce training and certification programs.

However, the effectiveness of these training programs has not been fully optimized. The implementation of training policies is often hampered by budget constraints and the inadequate competence of the organizers' human resources. This has an impact on the utilization of facilities and infrastructure and the quality of training (Ananda et al., 2021). In addition, there are challenges related to the suitability of the participants' backgrounds with the training field they are enrolled in, which causes participants to have difficulty following the material and results in low competency test pass rates (Setiawan & Casmiwati, 2024). These conditions highlight the importance of a comprehensive evaluation of training program implementation policies, particularly to ensure that policies implemented by local governments are truly efficient in resource utilization and effectively reach the target groups.

Public policy evaluation is necessary to assess the extent to which a program is able to achieve its objectives and have a real impact on society. (Mustofa & Dewi, 2017) emphasizes that the application of multidimensional evaluation can provide an overview of the success of policies in improving the welfare of society. Therefore, a systematic and theory-based evaluative approach is needed to assess the effectiveness of training programs. One relevant approach is public policy evaluation according to William N. Dunn. (Dunn, 2018) proposes six comprehensive dimensions of policy evaluation, namely effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy. Evaluation using these dimensions can provide a comprehensive picture of the success of program implementation and aspects that need improvement.

The limited focus in studies on training and certification of prospective workers, which generally emphasize only the effectiveness or outcome of programs without considering other dimensions such as efficiency and equity, shows that the implementation of comprehensive public policy evaluation is still not optimal. It is important to consider the aspect of equity in policy evaluation so that public policies, including job training programs, are not only oriented towards formal achievements but also reach the needs of the community in an inclusive manner (Mustofa, 2011). This theoretical gap exists because previous evaluations have tended to focus on a single aspect, while William N. Dunn's theory of public policy evaluation emphasizes the importance of multidimensional analysis that includes effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy. Furthermore, the application of Dunn's theory-based evaluative approach in the context of local workforce training is still very rare, especially when participants are placed as the main subjects of evaluation.

The novelty of this research is characterized by the comprehensive application of William N. Dunn's public policy evaluation model in the context of regional workforce training and certification programs, with a particular emphasis on the perspectives of participants as the primary target group. This approach not only assesses the program's achievements but also reveals how participants' perceptions reflect the effectiveness, efficiency, equity, and accuracy of the policy. Thus, this study provides a theoretical contribution to the development of a public policy-based training evaluation model while offering practical recommendations for local governments in formulating more responsive and targeted workforce training policies that are capable of increasing the absorption of local workers in the face of a dynamic world of work.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Public Policy and Public Policy Evaluation

Public policy evaluation plays a strategic role in assessing the effectiveness of labor training program implementation in regions. Various studies indicate that policy success is influenced by internal factors such as resources, communication, implementers' dispositions, and bureaucratic structures (Rahma, 2019). Evaluations that consider these factors are crucial for identifying obstacles and potential improvements in the implementation of job training.

(Eldora et al., 2023) emphasizes the importance of selecting a contextual policy analysis model, given that training policies must respond to evolving skill needs due to digitalization and globalization. An adaptive evaluation approach to labor market dynamics will help prevent program stagnation and ensure training relevance. Additionally, (Muadi et al., 2016) outlines that public policy cycle theories, such as formulation, implementation, and evaluation, can serve as a comprehensive framework for examining job

training programs. In this case, evaluation functions not only as a measure of success but also as a basis for policy revisions to make them more efficient and targeted.

With reference to these academic sources, the evaluation of job training in the regions needs to include contextual indicators such as participant characteristics, availability of facilities, and suitability to local needs. This approach will support the achievement of the main objectives of the policy, namely improving the quality of human resources and reducing unemployment.

Workforce Training, Human Capital, and Skills Mismatch

Workforce training is an important strategy in improving the quality of human resources and economic competitiveness. Based on a study by the (Suryani et al., 2023) training serves to improve short-term competencies, while human resource development aims to prepare individuals for greater responsibilities in the future. The implementation of training must have clear objectives and methods that are in line with the needs of the organization or region.

A study by (Tholib et al., 2025) shows that consistent training and compensation have a positive impact on work productivity and efficiency. This study uses a *Systematic Literature Review* approach to 21 national and international articles and emphasizes the importance of strategic planning in training design to improve adaptation to the dynamics of the work environment.

However, the effectiveness of training does not only depend on the number of participants or certificates issued. A study by (Selviyanti et al., 2019) in the *Masharif al-Syariah Journal* highlights the importance of alignment between training and industry needs. Skills mismatch represents a major challenge, referring to the incompatibility between the skills acquired by training participants and the demands of the labor market. This study suggests that training should be tailored to local

characteristics and that industry needs should be mapped before implementation. Furthermore, selecting trainees with appropriate educational backgrounds and basic competencies is crucial. If participants come from non-technical fields but are enrolled in technical training, the effectiveness of the training tends to decline. This is supported by findings from various studies, which show that proper participant selection and the adaptation of training curricula to local needs can improve competency test pass rates and increase employment absorption.

Based on a literature review, it can be concluded that workforce training plays a strategic role in improving the quality of human resources and labor absorption. However, its implementation still faces a number of obstacles, such as limited resources, a mismatch in participant competencies, and a lack of relevance between the material and industry needs. Most evaluations of previous programs tend to emphasize only output achievement or short-term effectiveness, so that other aspects such as efficiency, equitable access, responsiveness, adequacy, and accuracy have not been comprehensively analyzed.

METHODS

This study uses a descriptive quantitative approach with an evaluative research type, as it aims to measure participants' perceptions of the training and certification program for prospective workers at the Surabaya City Manpower Office in a systematic and objective manner. According to Sugiyono (in Purba, 2021), a quantitative approach was chosen because it can produce empirical descriptions in the form of numerical data that can be analyzed statistically, making it more measurable in evaluation. The focus of the research was directed at William N. Dunn's six dimensions of public policy evaluation, namely effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy.

The research data consisted of primary and secondary data. Primary data were collected through a structured questionnaire distributed to 115 respondents, who were selected using purposive sampling. This technique was chosen to ensure that respondents were participants who had completed or were currently participating in the training and certification program and thus could provide relevant and credible evaluations. The selection criteria included participation status, training completion, and understanding of program components. The questionnaire instrument used a 1–5 Likert scale, where 1 represents “strongly disagree” and 5 represents “strongly agree,” with statements covering the six dimensions of evaluation. The research population consisted of all individuals who participated in the training and certification program organized by the Surabaya City Manpower Office in the most recent period. The sample size of 115 respondents was considered sufficient based on the principle of representativeness in quantitative research and in accordance with (Notoatmodjo, 2018) who states that a minimum of 30–100 respondents can provide stable estimates in behavioral and policy studies. Meanwhile, secondary data was obtained through interviews with informants from the Surabaya City Manpower Office who are authorized to manage workforce training and certification programs. These interviews were not used as primary data, but rather as supporting information to strengthen and deepen the results of the questionnaire analysis, particularly regarding policies, implementation mechanisms, budget utilization, the relevance of training to labor market needs, and challenges faced in implementing the program. Thus, this study remains focused on quantitative analysis through questionnaire data, while interview data is only used to complement the descriptive results for a more comprehensive interpretation.

The research instrument, in the form of a questionnaire, was developed based on the

indicators of each dimension of Dunn's evaluation. For example, effectiveness is measured through the achievement of training objectives, efficiency through the utilization of resources, time, and facilities, adequacy through the completeness of training materials, equity through equal access and opportunities for all participants, responsiveness through the suitability of the program to the needs and expectations of participants, and accuracy through the relevance of training outcomes and certification to the demands of the world of work. Before use, the instruments were tested for validity and reliability. The validity test is carried out using the Pearson Product Moment correlation technique to determine the accuracy of the statement items in measuring indicators, while the reliability test uses Cronbach's Alpha value. The instrument is declared valid if the calculated r is greater than the table r and reliable if the Alpha value is greater than 0.70 according to Ghazali (in Syarifuddin & Ibnu, 2022).

The collected data was then analyzed using descriptive statistics through calculations of means, percentages, and frequency distributions. This analysis aims to provide a comprehensive overview of participants' perceptions of the implementation of the workforce training and certification program at the Surabaya City Manpower Office. With this approach, the study is expected to be able to comprehensively evaluate how the training and certification of prospective workers are carried out and to what extent the program is effective, efficient, targeted, and in line with the needs of participants and the job market.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This study involved 115 respondents who were participants in the training and certification program for prospective workers at the Surabaya City Manpower Office. Respondents were selected using *purposive sampling* based on specific criteria, individuals who had completed the program. Data were collected through a questionnaire with a Likert

scale containing 24 statements, each representing six dimensions of public policy evaluation according to William N. Dunn. The results show that the majority

of respondents were in the productive age group of 20–29 years and had a senior high school or vocational school educational background.

Table 1. Respondent Characteristics

Characteristics		Percentage
Gender	Male	42.6%
	Female	57.4%
	Total	100.0%
Age	≤ 20 years	20%
	21–25 years	28.7%
	26–30 years	26.1%
	31–35 years	24.3%
	> 35 years old	0.9%
	Total	100.0%
	Highest Level of Education	Elementary
Junior High School		0%
Senior High School or Vocational School		44.3%
Diploma		19.1%
Bachelor		36.4%
Total		100.0%

Source: 2025 Research

Based on the data presented in Table 1, the majority of program participants were women (57.4% or 66 people), while men accounted for 42.6% (49 people). This indicates that the training and certification programs were more widely attended by women. Regarding the highest level of education, most respondents had a senior high school or vocational school background (44.3%), followed by a bachelor’s degree (36.4%) and a diploma (19.1%). None of the participants had only an elementary or junior high school education. These findings suggest that participants generally come from secondary and higher education levels. In terms of age, the largest proportion of respondents were aged 21–25 years (28.7%), followed by 26–30 years (26.1%) and 31–35 years (24.3%). Meanwhile, 20.0% of respondents were aged ≤ 20 years, and

only 0.9% were over 35 years old. This distribution shows that the majority of participants are in their early to middle productive years, which is relevant to the need for skills enhancement before entering the workforce.

Effectiveness of Training and Certification Programs Based on Participant Perceptions

In terms of effectiveness, this assessment examined the extent to which the training and certification program for prospective workers achieved its intended objectives. The indicators used included the relevance of the training materials, the improvement of participants’ skills, their understanding of the intended field of work, and the timeliness of program implementation. Participants’ perceptions of these indicators are presented in the following table.

Table 2. Effectiveness of Training and Certification Programs

Statement	Response				
	1	2	3	4	5
Training materials tailored to the needs and objectives of the program.	0%	0.9%	17.4%	40.9%	40.9%
After attending the training, my skills have really improved.	0%	0.9%	19.1%	42.6%	37.4%
Training helped me understand the tasks/work involved.	0%	1.7%	15.7%	46.1%	36.5%
Training can be completed on time.	0%	1.7%	20%	43.5%	34.8%

Source: 2025 Research

Based on the results in Table 2, it shows that the effectiveness of the training and certification program for prospective workers in Surabaya is considered positive by most participants. The majority of respondents considered the training material to be in line with the needs and objectives of the program, as indicated by 81.8% of respondents giving answers in the agree and strongly agree categories. In addition, 80% of participants stated that their skills had improved after participating in the training, which confirms the relevance and benefits of the program for the development of work competencies. Understanding of the targeted job field was also rated as good, with 82.6% of respondents agreeing and strongly agreeing, although there were still around 17.4% who felt that the benefits were not optimal. In terms of timeliness, the majority of respondents (78.3%) considered the implementation to be on schedule, although 21.7% considered the opposite. Overall, these results show that the training and certification program has been quite effective in achieving its main objectives, although there is still room for improvement, especially in terms of punctuality and the suitability of learning methods to the needs of some participants.

Discussion of the research results on the dimension of effectiveness can be linked to William N. Dunn's (2018) theory of public policy evaluation, which emphasizes that effectiveness focuses on the extent to which a program is able to achieve its stated objectives. Based on the findings in Table 2, the

majority of participants assessed that the training material was appropriate to their needs, their skills had improved, and their understanding of their field of work had become better. This indicates that the program's objective, which is to improve the competence of prospective workers so that they are better prepared to enter the job market, has been substantially achieved. These findings are in line with the view (Ramdhani & Ramdhani, 2017) that policy effectiveness can be measured by the alignment between inputs, processes, and outputs with the expected goals. Additionally, in the study (Pratama et al., 2022) it was also emphasized that the effectiveness of job training is greatly influenced by the suitability of the material to the participants' needs, tangible skill improvement, and timely implementation.

Efficiency of Training and Certification Programs Based on Participant Perceptions

Efficiency is an important dimension in evaluating training and certification programs, as it emphasizes the extent to which available resources can be optimally utilized to achieve program objectives. Efficiency relates to the utilization of time, facilities, teaching staff, and management of program implementation to ensure smooth operations without waste. The following table presents participants' perceptions of the efficiency aspects of the implementation of training and certification programs at the Surabaya City Manpower Office.

Table 3. Efficiency of Training and Certification Programs

Statement	Answer				
	1	2	3	4	5
Training time is used effectively (not much time is wasted).	0%	13%	39.1%	38.3%	9.6%
Training facilities and equipment are used optimally.	0%	8.7%	41.7%	33.9%	15.7%
The organizer manages the schedule and materials so that the learning process runs smoothly.	0.9%	13%	33%	37.4%	15.7%
The ratio of instructors to participants is adequate for the learning process.	0.9%	7.8%	46.1%	29.6%	15.7%

Source: 2025 Research

Based on the results in Table 3, it shows that the efficiency of the training and certification program for prospective workers in Surabaya is considered quite good by the majority of participants. In terms of time management, 47.9% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed that the training time was used effectively, although 39.1% were neutral and 13% disagreed. The use of training facilities and equipment was rated as agree and strongly agree by 49.6% of participants, while 41.7% rated it as neutral. The aspect of schedule and material management received a positive rating, with 53.1% of respondents agreeing and strongly agreeing, although 33% were in the neutral category and 13.9% disagreed. Regarding the ratio of instructors to participants, 45.3% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed, while the majority of the others (46.1%) chose neutral. Overall, these results show that the training and certification program has been running quite efficiently, although there is still room for improvement, especially in terms of the instructor-to-participant ratio and the optimal use of time.

Discussion of the research results on the efficiency of the training and certification program shows that the use of time, facilities, and schedule management are considered quite good by participants, although there are still challenges in the

ratio of instructors to the number of participants, which tends to be unbalanced. This is in line with William N. Dunn's (2018) theory of public policy evaluation, which states that efficiency emphasizes the optimal comparison between input and output, where the success of a program depends on the maximum utilization of resources to achieve the desired results. These findings are also consistent with the research (Iffah & Yanti, 2025), which emphasizes the importance of systematic schedule planning and increasing instructor capacity to improve the efficiency of job training, so that the program can run more effectively without wasting resources.

Adequacy of Training and Certification Programs Based on Participant Perceptions

Adequacy is an important dimension in evaluating training and certification programs, emphasizing the extent to which a program can adequately meet the needs of participants. Adequacy is related to the completeness of materials, availability of modules, facilities and infrastructure, and the quality of instructors who can support successful learning. Participants' perceptions of the adequacy of the implementation of training and certification programs at the Surabaya City Manpower Office can be seen in the following table.

Table 4. Adequacy of Training and Certification Programs

Statement	Response				
	1	2	3	4	5
Training materials cover relevant competency requirements.	0%	10.4%	42.6%	29.6%	17.4%
The modules or teaching materials provided are sufficient and easy to understand.	0%	10.4%	40.9%	33%	15.7%
Training facilities/infrastructure are adequate.	0.9%	13.9%	41.7%	27.8%	15.7%
The quality of instructors supports learning in training	0.9%	10.4%	42.6%	27.8%	18.3%

Source: 2025 Research

Based on the results in Table 4, the majority of respondents assessed that the adequacy of the training program was running quite well, although it was not yet fully optimal. In terms of training materials, 47% of participants agreed and strongly agreed that the materials covered relevant competency requirements, while 42.6% chose neutral. The availability of modules or teaching materials was considered adequate by 40.9%, while 48.7% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed, indicating that the teaching materials were relatively adequate but some participants had not yet felt the optimal benefits. In terms of facilities and infrastructure, 43.5% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed, while 41.7% were neutral and 14.8% disagreed, indicating that the quality of existing facilities was not yet fully uniform. In terms of instructor quality, 46.1% of participants agreed and strongly agreed that the instructors supported learning, although 42.6% remained neutral. In general, these results illustrate that the training program is considered adequate, but there is still room for improvement, especially in the provision of facilities and the deepening of competencies through materials and instructors.

Discussion of these research results can be linked to William N. Dunn's (2018) theory of public policy evaluation, which explains that adequacy focuses on the extent to which a policy is effective enough to solve the problems faced. In the context of this study, the adequacy of training is reflected in the relevance of the material, the availability of teaching materials, supporting facilities, and the quality of

instructors. The results of this study show that although most participants rated the adequacy of the program as good, the high proportion of neutral responses indicates doubts regarding the optimization of training support components. This is in line with the study (Laia & Rahayu, 2025) which confirms that the success of job training is not only determined by the availability of modules and facilities, but also by the quality of instructors and the relevance of the material to the needs of the job market. Therefore, training programs in Surabaya need to strengthen their adequacy, especially in terms of facilities and instructor quality, in order to provide more comprehensive benefits for participants.

Equity in Training and Certification Programs Based on Participant Perceptions

Equity is an important dimension in the evaluation of training and certification programs because it focuses on the extent to which all participants have equal opportunities to access the benefits of the program without discrimination. Equity not only covers a fair selection process, but also relates to equal opportunities to participate in training, accessibility of locations, and equitable distribution of information. Therefore, this dimension is an important indicator for assessing whether the program can truly reach all prospective workers in an inclusive manner. The table below presents participants' perceptions of the equity of training and certification programs organized by the Surabaya City Manpower Office.

Table 5. Equity of Training and Certification Programs

Statement	Response				
	1	2	3	4	5
The participant selection process is conducted fairly and transparently.	1.7%	15.7%	43.5%	26.1%	13%
All participants had equal opportunities to participate in the entire training program.	0%	20%	36.5%	26.1%	17.4%
The training location is easily accessible to participants.	0.9%	12.2%	38.3%	33.9%	14.8%
Information about the program is disseminated evenly to prospective participants.	0%	19.1%	28.7%	40%	12.2%

Source: 2025 Research

Based on the results in Table 5, the majority of respondents assessed that the distribution of training and certification programs in Surabaya was going quite well, although it was not yet fully optimal. In terms of participant selection, 39.1% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed that the process was conducted fairly and transparently, while 43.5% were neutral, indicating that there were still doubts regarding the objectivity of the selection. On the indicator of equal opportunity, 43.5% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed, although 36.5% chose neutral and 20% disagreed, indicating that not all participants feel they have full and equal access to the entire training program. Meanwhile, the distribution of training information was rated positively by 48.6% of respondents who agreed and strongly agreed, but 35.7% remained neutral. The accessibility of training locations was also rated quite good, with 45.2% of respondents agreeing and strongly agreeing, although 39.1% were neutral. Overall, these results indicate that the program is fairly equitable, but there are still challenges in terms of selection transparency, equal opportunity, and equitable information dissemination.

Discussion of the research results shows that training and certification programs have paid sufficient attention to equity, particularly in terms of fair participant selection and relatively easy access to locations. However, there are still challenges in information distribution and equal opportunities, as seen from the percentage of respondents who consider that these aspects are not yet fully equitable.

These findings are in line with Dunn's (2018) view that equity in public policy is not only related to the distribution of benefits but also ensuring that every individual has equal access to existing opportunities. Previous research by (Nugroho et al., 2020) also states that equitable access to job training programs in Indonesia is often hampered by weak socialization and limited information outreach to the community. In addition, (Ardiansyah et al., 2022) notes that equity does not only depend on the openness of the program, but also on ease of access and institutional support in its implementation. Thus, although the equity aspect of this program has been running quite well, improvements in program outreach strategies and adjustments to recruitment methods to be more inclusive and responsive to the diverse needs of prospective participants need to be considered so that the benefits of the program can be felt comprehensively.

Responsiveness of Training and Certification Programs Based on Participant Perceptions

Responsiveness is an evaluation dimension related to the extent to which training and certification programs are able to adapt to the needs of participants and the demands of the job market. This aspect includes the relevance of the curriculum to industry needs, the suitability of the material to the participants' backgrounds, the provision of relevant skills, and the existence of a feedback mechanism for participants. The results of the research on responsiveness are presented in the following table.

Table 6. Responsiveness of Training and Certification Programs

Statement	Response				
	1	2	3	4	5
A training curriculum responsive to current industry needs.	0.9%	13.9%	37.4%	36.5%	11.3%
Training materials can be tailored to the background and abilities of participants.	0%	15.7%	34.8%	33%	16.5%
Training provides relevant skills for actual job opportunities.	0.9%	18.3%	30.4%	33%	17.4%
The existence of a feedback mechanism for participants after training.	0%	19.1%	34.8%	24.3%	21.7%

Source: 2025 Research

The results in Table 6 show that participants' perceptions of program responsiveness are in the fairly good category. A total of 47.8% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed that the training curriculum was responsive to industry needs. In terms of the suitability of the material to the participants' backgrounds, 49.5% of respondents gave a positive assessment,

while 15.7% still felt that it was not suitable. The relevance of training to actual job opportunities was also rated as good, with 50.4% of respondents agreeing and strongly agreeing, although 18.3% assessed it otherwise. The feedback mechanism after training was considered the most varied, with 46% of respondents agreeing and strongly agreeing, but 19.1% considered that there was no adequate mechanism. Overall, the responsiveness of the program was quite good, but there was still room for improvement in adjusting the material to the participants' backgrounds and strengthening the feedback mechanism.

Discussion of these results shows that the responsiveness of the training and certification program in Surabaya has been quite good in adjusting the curriculum to industry needs and providing relevant skills to participants. However, there are still obstacles in terms of the suitability of the material for all participants and the suboptimal feedback mechanism. This is in line with Dunn

(2018), who states that responsiveness is the ability of policies to respond to the needs and aspirations of the target community. Previous research also shows that the effectiveness of job training is greatly influenced by curriculum flexibility and openness to participant input. As explained in *the Indonesian Training Quality Framework* (Kemenaker & GIZ, 2016), job training that is adaptive to the needs of industry and participants is part of the eight national training quality standards, including competency-based curricula and relevant skills assessments. Thus, increasing responsiveness through more personalized curriculum adaptation and strengthening feedback mechanisms is essential to ensure that participants can maximize the benefits of the program.

Accuracy of Training and Certification Programs Based on Participant Perceptions

Accuracy is an evaluation dimension that assesses the extent to which training and certification programs are truly appropriate and relevant to the needs of participants and the demands of the job market. This aspect includes the recognition of certificates by the business/industrial world, the suitability of competency standards, the accuracy of training outcomes, and the contribution of training to increasing participants' employment opportunities. The results of the research on accuracy are presented in Table 7 below.

Table 7. Accuracy of Training and Certification Programs

Statement	Response				
	1	2	3	4	5
The certificates issued are recognized by the business/industrial world.	0%	15.7%	32.2%	35.7%	16.5%
Competency standards are used according to labor market needs.	0%	15.7%	33.9%	29.6%	20.9%
Training and certification results are targeted at the required job fields.	0.9%	15.7%	37.4%	29.6%	16.5%
Training helps improve my chances in the job market.	0%	11.3%	37.4%	31.3%	20%

Source: 2025 Research

The results in Table 7 show that the accuracy of training and certification programs is considered quite positive by the majority of participants. In terms of certificate recognition, 52.2% of respondents agree and strongly agree that certificates are recognized by the business/industrial world, although 15.7% still think otherwise. The competency standards used are also considered appropriate for the needs of the job market by 50.5% of respondents, while 15.7% feel that they are not yet appropriate. Furthermore, the results of training and certification are considered on target by 46.1% of respondents who answered agree and strongly agree, although there are still 16.6% who consider them not appropriate. Regarding the indicator of increased employment opportunities, 51.3% of respondents agreed and strongly agreed, but 11.3% of respondents did not yet feel the direct benefits. Overall, more than half of the respondents considered the program to be quite effective, although a small number of participants felt that the benefits were not yet optimal.

Discussion of these results shows that the training and certification program is quite effective in providing tangible benefits to participants, particularly through the recognition of certificates and their contribution to increasing employment opportunities. However, there are still challenges in terms of the suitability of training outcomes to the field of work and the application of competency standards that do not yet fully address the needs of all participants. This is in line with Dunn's (2018) view, which emphasizes that accuracy is a measure of the suitability of policy objectives and outcomes to the problems to be addressed. Previous research by (Sari & Suwandi, 2025) also explains that the success of training programs is highly dependent on the suitability of the curriculum and certification to the real needs of the industry. Thus, although the accuracy of the program is already quite good, further alignment between competency standards, training materials, and labor market needs needs to be improved so that the program results are more relevant and beneficial.

Table 8. Summary of Results

Variable	Mean	SD	Category
Effectiveness	4.00	0.78	High-Very High
Efficiency	3.64	0.80	Moderate-High
Sufficiency	3.62	0.87	Moderate-High
Equity	3.54	0.91	Moderate-High
Responsiveness	3.68	1.04	Moderate-High
Accuracy	3.80	0.95	Moderate-High

Source: 2025 Research

The results of this study indicate that effectiveness is the most prominent dimension in training and certification programs for prospective workers in Surabaya, suggesting that the main objectives of the program have been relatively achieved. These findings are in line with the study (Setiawan & Casmiwati, 2024), which shows that the majority of training participants at the Surabaya Job Training Center consider the program effective in improving job skills and readiness for the labor market. However, equity remains a major obstacle, as indicated by (Khoirun Nisa, 2018), which identifies the mismatch between beneficiaries and the groups most in need as a barrier to distribution in the implementation of job training programs. When the selected participants do not fully reflect vulnerable groups or the long-term unemployed,

perceptions of unfairness arise that can reduce social acceptance of the program. In this study, efficiency was assessed as relatively good, while the uneven distribution of benefits was more prominent.

Overall, the results show that the training and certification program has been running quite well, with participants giving positive ratings to almost all indicators. The dominant factors influencing success are: (1) high effectiveness, (2) relatively adequate efficiency and adequacy, (3) responsiveness and accuracy in line with needs, and (4) equity that still needs to be improved. These findings reinforce the principle of public policy evaluation that good policies should be assessed not only in terms of the achievement of objectives, but also in terms of the equitable distribution of benefits to all program targets.

Table 9. Results of Interviews with Disperinaker Officials

No.	Question	Informant's Answer
1.	To what extent have the targets for this year's training and certification program been achieved?	"Every year, the training and certification program runs well and the targets are always achieved."
2.	To what extent does the number of participants who pass meet the target?	"Every year, the number of participants who pass is in line with the target."
3.	Is there any data on the success of participants in obtaining employment after training?	"It cannot be immediately confirmed whether they will get a job right away, but the employment rate has reached more than 50%. It cannot be immediate because it does take time."

- | | | |
|----|--|---|
| 4. | How does the program training budget compare to the actual implementation of activities? | “Budgeting for an activity is always done in advance, and there are usually additional funds because the budget is insufficient when considering the number of people who want to participate in the program, especially since each type of training has a different budget, with 24 types of training available.” |
| 5. | How is the program evaluation mechanism conducted? | “Evaluations are conducted quarterly, and there is also a survey in the form of a questionnaire to determine whether participants have secured employment after the training.” |
| 6. | In your opinion, how relevant is this training to the needs of the local job market? | “I think it is still relevant and very constructive, but we are constrained by the fact that we do not have a training facility, so we have to collaborate with training institutions, and not all training institutions or vocational training centers have programs that are relevant to the current situation. For example, not all of them have programs in AI, science, and the like.” |
| 7. | Is the training aligned with the participants’ backgrounds and interests? | “So far, most of it has been suitable because, from the perspective of interest, I think it all stems from proposals from various parties, including suggestions on social media. So I think it aligns with what is in demand. However, there are some programs that are extremely popular, so the quota exceeds the limit.” |

Source: Research 2025

Interview results indicate that the annual training and certification program targets are consistently met. One informant said, *"The number of participants who pass is in line with the target each year, so in terms of implementation, it is quite effective"* (Interview, August 8, 2025). This statement confirms that the program is running effectively, although the success of participants in obtaining employment cannot be directly ascertained. However, the employment rate of more than 50 percent indicates that the program has made a positive contribution to increasing employment opportunities.

From a budgetary perspective, one informant explained, *"Often the budget is insufficient because there are many interested parties and the types of training are diverse, so sometimes additional funds are needed"* (Interview, August 8, 2025). This situation illustrates the challenge of funding adequacy that must be anticipated in order to meet all training needs.

Evaluation mechanisms are also carried out periodically. An informant mentioned, *"There are evaluations every quarter, plus post-training surveys to monitor the results"* (Interview, August 8, 2025). This shows that there is a fairly systematic

monitoring system in place to ensure the quality of program implementation.

In terms of relevance, the program is still considered to be in line with local labor market needs. One informant said, *"The training is suitable for the job market in Surabaya, although fields such as AI and data science are not yet available"* (Interview, August 8, 2025). This finding shows that limitations in facilities and training partners mean that certain strategic fields are not yet fully accommodated.

In terms of participant interest, most of the training was considered to be in line with their needs. One informant said, *"Many people registered until the quota was full, and some even had to wait for the next batch"* (Interview, August 8, 2025). This confirms that the program is quite popular and responsive to the needs of the community.

Overall, the interview results show that the training and certification program for prospective workers at the Surabaya Manpower Office is running quite well, although it still faces challenges in terms of budget adequacy, equitable access, and relevance to modern industry trends.

CONCLUSION

Write a conclusion based on your interpretation of the findings and discussion. The conclusion presents critical points that explain the answers to research questions. In this section, the author can provide input and recommendations. Suggestions present advanced ideas to be developed in subsequent research or practical improvement. This study demonstrates that the training and certification program for prospective workers implemented by the Surabaya City Manpower Office has generally generated positive outcomes for participants, although several challenges remain to be addressed. In terms of **effectiveness**, the program has been relatively successful in enhancing participants' skills and knowledge; however, issues related to time discipline and the alignment of training materials with current industry demands have not yet been fully optimized. Regarding **efficiency**, the utilization of resources and training schedules is fairly well managed, yet the limited availability of qualified instructors and adequate training equipment continues to hinder optimal implementation. From the perspective of **adequacy**, the facilities, training modules, and instructor quality can be considered

reasonably sufficient, although they do not yet fully address participants' specific competency needs in greater depth. The dimension of **equity** indicates that program implementation has been relatively fair, particularly in terms of participant selection and geographic accessibility, but improvements are still needed in information dissemination and ensuring equal opportunities for all potential participants. **Responsiveness** is reflected in the program's ability to adapt training content to participants' interests and needs, although participant feedback has not been comprehensively integrated into program design and implementation. Finally, with respect to **accuracy**, the certificates issued are recognized by employers and can broaden employment opportunities; however, stronger linkages with business and industry networks are still required to ensure that the program outcomes align more directly with labor market demands.

Overall, it can be concluded that the training and certification program has been functioning reasonably well and has produced positive impacts, but **continuous improvements are essential** to maximize its relevance and effectiveness. Recommended strategies for improvement include: (1) strengthening curriculum alignment with industry requirements to ensure that participants' competencies match current labor market needs; (2) enhancing training facilities, infrastructure, and instructor capacity to increase operational efficiency; (3) expanding access and ensuring transparency in the participant selection process to promote equal opportunities; (4) improving information dissemination mechanisms so that program details are more evenly distributed and reach target groups effectively; (5) developing a periodic evaluation system involving participants, instructors, and key stakeholders to support continuous policy learning and adaptation; and (6) standardizing competencies in a way that is adaptive to various industrial sectors, ensuring that certification remains both relevant and beneficial.

REFERENCES

- Afifah, J., & Abdullah, M. N. A. (2024). Kebijakan Pemerintah Dalam Membangun Ketenagakerjaan Yang Berkelanjutan Untuk Mensejahterakan Kehidupan Masyarakat. *SABANA: Jurnal Sosiologi, Antropologi, Dan Budaya Nusantara*, 3(2), 84–92. <https://doi.org/10.55123/sabana.v3i2.3306>
- Amarullah, A., Imaniah, I., & Muthmainnah, S. (2023). Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia (Sdm) Di Era Digital Melalui Pelatihan Sertifikasi Kompetensi Di Universitas Muhammadiyah Tangerang. *Prosiding Simposium Nasional Multidisiplin (SinaMu)*, 4, 479. <https://doi.org/10.31000/sinamu.v4i1.7956>
- Ananda, Y. F., Flora, E. F. H., Hana, N. N., & Wibawani, S. (2021). Efektivitas Program Pelatihan Berbasis Kompetensi Di Upt Blk Surabaya Dalam Mengurangi Pengangguran. *Publica : Jurnal Administrasi Pembangunan Dan Kebijakan Publik*, 12(2), 128. <https://doi.org/10.33772/publica.v12i2.18133>
- Ardiansyah, F. yulian, Afifuddin, & Anadza, H. (2022). EFEKTIVITAS PELAKSANAAN PROGRAM PELATIHAN KERJA PADA UPT DAYA MANUSIA Program Studi Ilmu Administrasi Negara , Ilmu Administrasi , Universitas Islam Malang Jl . MT Haryono 193 Malang , 65144 , Indonesia Email : ferriyulian13@gmail.com Pendahuluan Rumusan. *Jurnal Respon Publik*, 16(3), 6–11.
- Asmara, G. D., & Saleh, R. (2024). Determinants of Unemployment: Empirical Evidence from Indonesia. *Widya Cipta: Jurnal Sekretari Dan Manajemen*, 8(2), 102–108. <https://doi.org/10.31294/widyacipta.v8i2.2175>
- Dharmawan, M. R. F., Rifai, M., & Azijah, D. N. (2022). Evaluasi Program Pelatihan Tenaga Kerja Berbasis Kopetensi Oleh Dinas Tenaga Kerja Kota Bekasi Tahun 2021. *Reformasi*, 12(1), 19–27. <https://doi.org/10.33366/rfr.v12i1.3104>
- Dunn, W. N. (2018). Kebijakan Publik Versi William Dunn: Analisis Dan Implementasi. *Journal of Humanities and Social Studies*, 1(1), 1–9.
- Eldora, E., Wahyuningsih, A., Kurnia Jati, S., & Sabathina, S. (2023). *LITERATURE REVIEW : MODEL ANALISIS KEBIJAKAN PUBLIK LITERATURE REVIEW : PUBLIC POLICY ANALYSIS MODELS E. 2018*, 5–7.
- Iffah, I. A., & Yanti, M. N. (2025). *MENGOPTIMALKAN KINERJA KARYAWAN MELALUI PELATIHAN DAN PENGEMBANGAN : TINJAUAN LITERATUR*. 32–36.
- Kemenaker, & GIZ. (2016). *Kerangka Mutu Pelatihan Indonesia*.
- Khoirun Nisa, 050710302. (2018). Evaluasi Dampak Program Pelatihan Kerja Dinas Tenaga Kerja Kota Surabaya. *Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik*, 6(1), 1–14. <http://www.journal.unair.ac.id/KMP@evaluasi-dampak-program-pelatihan-kerja-article-12696-media-138-category-8.html>
- Laia, S. H., & Rahayu, E. (2025). *Optimalisasi Program Pelatihan untuk Meningkatkan Kinerja dan Kompetensi Optimizing Training Programs to Improve Performance and Competence*. 8(1), 111–118. <https://doi.org/10.34007/jehss.v8i1.2646>
- Maharani, A., Rafli, A., Y.L, A. N., Masturi, Rudiansyah, & U, B. (2024). Jurnal Manejemen, Akuntansi dan Pendidikan (JAMAPEDIK). *Jurnal Manajemen, Akuntansi Dan Pendidikan (JAMAPEDIK)*,

- I(2), 288–296.
<https://doi.org/10.59971/jamapedik.v1i2.65>
- Muadi, S., MH, I., & Sofwani, A. (2016). Konsep dan Kajian Teori Perumusan Kebijakan Publik. *JRP (Jurnal Review Politik)*, 6(2), 195–224.
<https://doi.org/10.15642/jrp.2016.6.2.195-224>
- Mustofa, A. (2011). REFORMASI ADMINISTRASI: PENDEKATAN BIROKRASI REPRESENTATIF DALAM MENINGKATKAN PERFORMA BIROKRASI Amirul. *Ilmu Komunikasi Dan Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 4, 141–154.
http://repository.unitomo.ac.id/232/1/cover_jurnal_kalamsiasi_PENDEKATAN REPRESENTATIVE BUREAUCRACY dalam ADMINISTRATION REFORM -1.pdf
- Mustofa, A., & Dewi, A. (2017). Analisis Kebijakan Regionalisasi Rujukan Terhadap Jumlah Kunjungan Dan Kepuasan Peserta Jkn Di Faskes Rujukan Tingkat Lanjutan. *JHES (Journal of Health Studies)*, 1(2), 186–196.
<https://doi.org/10.31101/jhes.338>
- Notoatmodjo. (2018). Metode Penelitian Etika Penelitian. *Jurnal UMPRI*, 10(1), 2–13.
- Nugroho, S., Pahmi, M. A., & Surya, A. (2020). Lokakarya Penguatan Kualitas Sumber Daya Manusia Generasi Muda Dalam Menghadapi Era Industrialisasi Global. *Bemas: Jurnal Bermasyarakat*, 1(1), 39–50.
- Nuraeni, Y., Yuliasuti, A., Nasution, F. A., Saepul Muharam, A., & Iqbal, F. (2022). Peran Balai Latihan Kerja (BLK) Komunitas Dalam Menyediakan Tenaga Kerja Pada Dunia Usaha dan Industri. *Jurnal Ketenagakerjaan*, 17(1).
<https://doi.org/10.47198/naker.v17i1.124>
- Pratama, M. N., Widowati, N., & Maesaroh. (2022). *EFEKTIVITAS PROGRAM PELATIHAN KERJA UPTD BALAI LATIHAN KERJA DINAS TENAGA KERJA KOTA SEMARANG*. 17, 302.
- Purba, Y. M. S. (2021). Implementasi Program Diklat Berjenjang Tingkat Dasar Dalam Jaringan Untuk Meningkatkan Kompetensi pendidik PAUD Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia. | *Repository.Upi.Edu* | *Perpustakaan.Upi.Edu*, 23.
- Rahma, Z. A. (2019). *yang bertujuan untuk mengkategorikan informasi-informasi dari begitu banyaknya literature yang telah dibuat, sehingga informasi pun dapat tersampaikan dengan jelas dan mudah dipahami. Karya tulis ini menggunakan metode.*
- Ramdhani, A., & Ramdhani, M. A. (2017). Konsep Umum Pelaksanaan Kebijakan Publik. *Jurnal Publik*, 1–12.
<https://doi.org/10.1109/ICMENS.2005.96>
- Ritonga, M. (2021). Upaya Mengurangi Pengangguran Melalui Ekonomi Kreatif. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat, 2021*, 61–70.
<http://journal.unj.ac.id/unj/index.php/snppm>
- Romadhon, A., & Zikra, A. (2022). Pengaruh Pelatihan Bersertifikat, Karakteristik Lulusan, dan Disabilitas Terhadap Pengangguran Usia Muda di Indonesia. *Seminar Nasional Official Statistics, 2022(1)*, 1359–1372.
<https://doi.org/10.34123/semnasoffstat.v2022i1.1556>
- Sari, P. D., & Suwandi. (2025). Efektivitas Program Pelatihan dan Pengembangan SDM di PT Unilever Indonesia dalam Mendukung Kinerja Organisasi. *Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 2(6), 89–95.
<https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.14634508>
- Selviyanti, N. H., Fadila, N., Sulis, Y. D., Anshori, I., Buyung, H., & Safrizal, A. (2019). Systematic Literature Review: Peran Pelatihan Dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia (Sdm) Dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Karyawan. *Jurnal Masharif Al-Syariah: Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Perbankan Syariah*, 8(3), 977–

988. <https://doi.org/10.30651/jms.v8i4.20987>

Setiawan, H. B., & Casmiwati, D. (2024). Efektivitas Program Pelatihan Berbasis Kompetensi di Balai Latihan Kerja, Kota Surabaya. *Jurnal Politik Dan Pemerintahan Daerah*, 6(1), 108–117. <https://doi.org/10.36355/jppd.v6i1.142>

Suryani, S., Rindaningsih, I., & Hidayatulloh. (2023). Pelatihan Dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia. *PERISAI: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Riset Ilmu Sains*, 2(3), 363–370. <https://doi.org/10.32672/perisai.v2i3.154>

Syarifuddin, & Ibnu, A. S. (2022). *Page 1 of 129*. [http://digilib.iain-palangkaraya.ac.id/4022/1/BUKU METODE RISET PRAKTIS.pdf](http://digilib.iain-palangkaraya.ac.id/4022/1/BUKU%20METODE%20RISET%20PRAKTIS.pdf)

Tholib, S. Z. A.-Z., Sersanti, F. D., Radita, V. D. C., & Rahmawati, C. I. (2025). Review Literature: Pelatihan dan Kompensasi Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan. *PRAGMATIS: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Bisnis*, 6, 13–23.